

Exercise 8.7. Semi-endogenous growth and endogenous growth if the productive externality arises from $\mathbf{Y}_{t}$ rather than from $\mathbf{K}_{t}$

Note the typo in this exercise in the first print of the book. The transition equation in Question 3 should read:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\tilde{k}_{t+1} & =\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \tilde{k}_{t}\left(s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)\right)^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \\
& =\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left(s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\frac{\alpha}{1-\phi}}+(1-\delta) \tilde{k}_{t}^{\frac{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi}}\right)^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}
\end{aligned}
$$

That is, the $\tilde{k}_{t}$ on the left hand side should be replaced by $\tilde{k}_{t+1}$, and the $s \tilde{k}_{t}^{[\alpha-\phi(1-\alpha)] /(1-\phi)}$ inside the parenthesis in the second line should be replaced by $s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha /(1-\phi)}$.

1. The aggregate production function is found by inserting $A_{t}=Y_{t}^{\phi}$ into (6):

$$
Y_{t}=\left(K_{t}\right)^{\alpha}\left(Y_{t}^{\phi} L_{t}\right)^{1-\alpha} \Leftrightarrow
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& Y_{t}^{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}=K_{t}^{\alpha} L_{t}^{1-\alpha} \Leftrightarrow \\
& Y_{t}=K_{t}^{\frac{\alpha}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} L_{t}^{\frac{1-\alpha}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} .
\end{aligned}
$$

Assuming that $\phi<1 /(1-\alpha)$ ensures that the exponents on $K_{t}$ and $L_{t}$ are positive. The sum of the exponents in the aggregate production function is: $\frac{\alpha}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}+\frac{1-\alpha}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}=$ $\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}>1$, so this function exhibits increasing returns to $K_{t}$ and $L_{t}$. When $\phi=1$ the production function reduces to

$$
Y_{t}=K_{t} L_{t}^{\frac{1-\alpha}{\alpha}},
$$

which has constant returns to $K_{t}$ alone.
2. From $A_{t}=Y_{t}^{\phi}$ and the aggregate production function one gets:

$$
\frac{A_{t+1}}{A_{t}}=\frac{Y_{t+1}^{\phi}}{Y_{t}^{\phi}}=\left(\frac{K_{t+1}}{K_{t}}\right)^{\frac{\alpha \phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left(\frac{L_{t+1}}{L_{t}}\right)^{\frac{\phi(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} .
$$

3. Parallel to the chapter's analysis of the model of semi-endogenous growth (Section 2) one derives:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{\tilde{k}_{t+1}}{\tilde{k}_{t}} & =\frac{\frac{K_{t+1}}{K_{t}}}{\frac{A_{t+1}}{A_{t}} \frac{L_{t+1}}{L_{t}}}=\frac{\frac{K_{t+1}}{K_{t}}}{\left(\frac{K_{t+1}}{K_{t}}\right)^{\frac{\alpha \phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left(\frac{L_{t+1}}{L_{t}}\right)^{\frac{\phi(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \frac{L_{t+1}}{L_{t}}} \\
& =\frac{\left(\frac{K_{t+1}}{K_{t}}\right)^{1-\frac{\alpha \phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}}{\left(\frac{L_{t+1}}{L_{t}}\right)^{\frac{\phi(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}+1}}=\frac{\left(\frac{K_{t+1}}{K_{t}}\right)^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}}{\left(\frac{L_{t+1}}{L_{t}}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}} \\
& =\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left(\frac{K_{t+1}}{K_{t}}\right)^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} .
\end{aligned}
$$

Now using the capital accumulation equation gives:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{\tilde{k}_{t+1}}{\tilde{k}_{t}} & =\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left(\frac{s Y_{t}+(1-\delta) K_{t}}{K_{t}}\right)^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \\
& =\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left[\frac{s \tilde{y}_{t}}{\tilde{k}_{t}}+(1-\delta)\right]^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}
\end{aligned}
$$

Inserting $\tilde{y}_{t}=\tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha}$, which follows from the production function, gives:

$$
\frac{\tilde{k}_{t+1}}{\tilde{k}_{t}}=\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left[s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)\right]^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \Leftrightarrow
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\tilde{k}_{t+1} & =\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \tilde{k}_{t}\left[s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)\right]^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \\
& =\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left(s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\frac{\alpha}{1-\phi}}+(1-\delta) \tilde{k}_{t}^{\frac{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi}}\right)^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}
\end{aligned}
$$

The last formula gives two alternative expressions for the transition curve.
By definition, in steady state $\tilde{k}_{t+1}=\tilde{k}_{t}=\tilde{k}^{*}$. Insert this in the transition equation (first expression) to find the steady state value of $\tilde{k}_{t}$ :

$$
\begin{gathered}
1=\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}\left(s\left(\tilde{k}^{*}\right)^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)\right)^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \Leftrightarrow \\
(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}=\left(s\left(\tilde{k}^{*}\right)^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)\right)^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \Leftrightarrow \\
(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}=s\left(\tilde{k}^{*}\right)^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta) \Leftrightarrow \\
\tilde{k}^{*}=\left(\frac{s}{(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}-(1-\delta)}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\alpha}} .
\end{gathered}
$$

Using $\tilde{y}_{t}=\tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha}$ gives the steady state value of $\tilde{y}_{t}$ :

$$
\tilde{y}^{*}=\left(\tilde{k}^{*}\right)^{\alpha}=\left(\frac{s}{(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}-(1-\delta)}\right)^{\frac{\alpha}{1-\alpha}}
$$

Under the stated condition, $(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}>(1-\delta)$, the denominators above are positive and the expressions for $\tilde{k}^{*}$ and $\tilde{y}^{*}$ are meaningful.

It has thus been established that the transition equation has a unique strictly positive intersection with the $45^{\circ}$-line. Furthermore, the transition curve passes through $(0,0)$ and is everywhere strictly increasing, as can be verified directly from inspection of the second formula for the transition curve (note that $\phi<1$ implies that all the exponents are positive). If the slope of the transition curve at the intersection with the $45^{\circ}$-line is smaller than one, convergence to steady state follows from 'stair case iteration' in the usual transition diagram. We compute the derivative (using the first of the expressions for the transition curve:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\frac{d \tilde{k}_{t+1}}{d \tilde{k}_{t}}=\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} . \\
{\left[\left[s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)\right]^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}}+\frac{(1-\phi)(\alpha-1)}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}\left[s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)\right]^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}-1} s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}\right]} \\
=\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \cdot\left[s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)\right]^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}-1}\left[s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}+(1-\delta)-\frac{(1-\phi)(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)} s \tilde{k}_{t}^{\alpha-1}\right] .
\end{gathered}
$$

Inserting here our expression for $\tilde{k}^{*}$ in place of $\tilde{k}_{t}$ gives the slope at $\tilde{k}^{*}$ :

$$
\begin{gathered}
\left.\frac{d \tilde{k}_{t+1}}{d \tilde{k}_{t}}\right|_{\tilde{k}_{t}=\tilde{k}^{*}}= \\
\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \cdot\left[(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}\right]^{\frac{1-\phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}-1}\left[(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}-\frac{(1-\phi)(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}\left((1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}-(1-\delta)\right)\right] \\
=\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \cdot\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi} \cdot \frac{\alpha \phi}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}} \cdot\left(\frac{1}{1+n}\right)^{-\frac{1}{1-\phi}} \cdot \\
{\left[1-\frac{(1-\phi)(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}\left(1-\frac{1-\delta}{(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}}\right)\right]} \\
=1-\frac{(1-\phi)(1-\alpha)}{1-\phi(1-\alpha)}\left(1-\frac{1-\delta}{(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}}\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

This is positive and smaller than one since: $(1+n)^{\frac{1}{1-\phi}}>(1-\delta)$ implies that the parenthesis is positive and smaller than one. The factor in front of the parenthesis is itself positive and smaller than one, so the product is positive and smaller than one. One minus the product must then also be positive and smaller than one.
4. Since $\tilde{y}_{t} \equiv y_{t} / A_{t}$ is constant in steady state, $y_{t}$ must grow at the same rate as $A_{t}$, that is, $y_{t+1} / y_{t}=A_{t+1} / A_{t}$. From $A_{t}=Y_{t}^{\phi}$ :

$$
\frac{A_{t+1}}{A_{t}}=\left(\frac{Y_{t+1}}{Y_{t}}\right)^{\phi}=\left(\frac{y_{t+1}}{y_{t}}\right)^{\phi}(1+n)^{\phi} .
$$

Inserting $A_{t+1} / A_{t}=y_{t+1} / y_{t}$ (which holds in steady state) and rearranging gives:

$$
\frac{y_{t+1}}{y_{t}}=\left(\frac{y_{t+1}}{y_{t}}\right)^{\phi}(1+n)^{\phi} \Longleftrightarrow \frac{y_{t+1}}{y_{t}}=(1+n)^{\frac{\phi}{1-\phi}} \Leftrightarrow
$$

$$
\frac{y_{t+1}-y_{t}}{y_{t}}=(1+n)^{\frac{\phi}{1-\phi}}-1 .
$$

When $\phi<1$ the exponent on $1+n$ is positive. Hence a larger population growth rate gives a higher growth rate of output per worker in steady state.
5. At the end of Question 1 we found that:

$$
Y_{t}=K_{t} L_{t}^{\frac{1-\alpha}{\alpha}},
$$

in case of $\phi=1$. Setting $n=0$ removes the time subscript on $L_{t}$. Define $A \equiv(L)^{(1-\alpha) / \alpha}$. Then:

$$
Y_{t}=A K_{t}
$$

Since there is no population growth and the productive externality is already embedded in the aggregate production function, the equation above and the capital accumulation equation (8),

$$
K_{t+1}=s Y_{t}+(1-\delta) K_{t}
$$

make up the entire model. Inserting $Y_{t}=A K_{t}$ into the capital accumulation equation and rearranging gives the growth rate of capital:

$$
K_{t+1}=s A K_{t}+(1-\delta) K_{t} \Leftrightarrow \frac{K_{t+1}-K_{t}}{K_{t}}=s A-\delta
$$

which, since $Y_{t}=A K_{t}$ and there is a constant labour force, is also the growth rate of $Y_{t}$, $k_{t}$, and $y_{t}$. We have, of course, found the same growth rate as in the chapter's 'AK-model', only with a slight difference in the definition of $A$. All features with respect to policy implications, scale effects etc. therefore bear over from the chapter's model to the one considered here.

## Exercise 8.8. Taxation and productive government spending: endogenous

 growth without productive externalities